Global Heritage Stone Resource

Final Report on the Reviews and final request to IUGS EC

Stone candidate: Estremoz Marble

Name of Reviewers: anonymous
anonymous

Review: Positive X
X

Negative

Specific comments and advise from reviewers:

Both reviewers agree that a list of examples in the form of a table would have been useful. However, the use of Estremoz Marble is so widespread that the list could have been far too extensive.

It is worthwhile to include the specific comment of one of the reviewers: The Estremoz Marbles are widely used and in terms of the attributes above fulfil 5 of the above; personally I am unsure of whether the stone is seen as a national iconic material (d) but if it is not this is surprising. It appears that the availability of the stone in future is not challenged – reserves are high.

Specific comments:

Provide comments on the review (if desired):
The HSS board discussed on the appropriateness of the following comment by one reviewer: “With regard to the section ‘inappropriate use of names’: From a geological point of view, this is of course correct, but the use of ‘marble’ for a polishable dense limestone is completely in line with EN 12670:2002, § 2.1.243. Therefore, I would suggest to delete this paragraph.”

The board agreed in omitting this recommendation and emphasize that, as experts on natural stones, we should insist on the proper use of names. “Marble” involves a metamorphism and recrystallization of carbonates; therefore a polished limestone should not be called marble, but limestone. Their behaviour can be very different in construction and building materials.
Other comments from the same reviewer refer to the publication itself, not the proposal. We agree that we should insist in the real task of evaluating a proposal for a stone as GHSR, which is not related to a second review of a paper that is already published. This discussion will be part of the I workshop on Heritage Stones, to be celebrated in Salamanca in October 2018

**Specific comments and advise from the coordinator of the review/board member**

The authors of this proposal were asked by the coordinator Brian Marker to add an extra document with information that was lacking in the published paper. This extra document is included in the file to the IUGS EC for approval, but also will be uploaded in the HSS web page for complete information on the stone.

The advise of the coordinator, **Dr Brian Marker**, is to accept the stone as candidate and proceed to request their nomination as GHSR

**Request to the IUGS EC:** Accept Estremoz Marble as GHSR

Date and signature of HSS Secretary General
6\textsuperscript{th} of January, 2018-01-06